

that “movements for economic democracy must be international” (p.103), Engler ultimately adheres to an analysis that assumes the authority of Western Marxists to determine “what poor countries need” (p.22) and indeed what’s ideal for the whole world.

In sum, Engler’s vision is consistent with the historicism, economism, and utopianism that Elliott describes as the “three cornerstones of historical Marxism [that have been] the articles of faith of nothing less than a secularized and sociologized ‘religion of the subaltern’ as Gramsci put it” (p.33). Elliott, on the other hand, is interested in the mobilizing power of this ‘faith’ while at the same time resigned to neoliberalism as proof that “the mere ability to table a task does not ensure its resolution” (p.24). Both are concerned with imagining an end to capitalism and grapple with Marx’s underestimation of its resilience. Engler avoids the historical stains on communism and socialism by choosing to call his alternative “economic democracy” while remaining bound to Marx’s assumption that capitalism creates the conditions for its alternative “on account of the intrinsically contradictory, and finally self-destructive, dynamics of its own development” (Elliott, p.10). Elliott, instead, takes a ‘can’t live with him, can’t live without him’ approach to Marx (p.ix) and draws on the historical developments in both Marxism and capitalism to try and identify an ‘end in sight’. He ultimately sees no end to capitalism however; only to socialism, given that “the argument from dystopia—socialism equals Stalinism, the worst of all possible worlds—is reinforced by the argument from utopia—socialism equals an impracticable ideal, an impossible best of all possible worlds” (p.24).

Rosalind Hampton
McGill University

Bill Freund and Harald Witt. (Eds.). *Development Dilemmas in Post-Apartheid South Africa: Review*. Pietermaritzburg: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2010. 424pp.

Development Dilemmas effectively spells out the challenges to South Africa’s post apartheid development across a range of spheres: the minerals-energy complex, state implementation, land, and gender. It is promising to see a volume that brings social and environmental issues together on equal footing, and hopefully this

will become commonplace in the future. Chapters range from being very empirical to significantly theoretical and is on the whole a good balance. Unfortunately, certain notable gaps kept it from being a comprehensive volume, and it may well have better aimed to focus more narrowly on questions of land and environment; it then would have been able to do full justice to the topic. As it stands, it tries to do a bit too much, and remains unsatisfying in some domains.

Part One explored the minerals-energy complex. Through three chapters on the Vaal Triangle, hydro-electric mega projects, and the Eskom crisis, the reader is given an overview of what powers South Africa. Unfortunately, the picture painted is one of corporate greed, with virtually complete disregard for the environment or community of operation. The section is peppered with mind-boggling statistics that highlight the difficulty of the situation. For example, “Twenty-nine companies consume 40% of the country’s electricity supply (p.119),” a significant part of this being consumed only by steel and aluminum smelters, who have a secret agreement on electricity use and pricing (how a parastatal is allowed to enter into secret deals isn’t discussed). Another figure that sticks with the reader is a conservative estimate that hospital costs from air pollution in the Vaal triangle total R289 million annually (p.76). Finally, the Eskom power grid has a capacity of about 40,000 MW, of which a paltry 3MW come from renewable energy (p.118). Even so, amidst stories of white elephants and pollution, the section is not without some optimism, and includes the story of a local municipality employee who risked his job to expose the prioritization of golf estates over basic service provision (p.98).

More than the rest, this section paints a forbidding picture of the development path chosen; this is doubly true as the two year old publication date has closed the door on some of the hope expressed in the text. For example, in Chapter 4 the potential for a reverse in corporate-friendly orientation of government was put forward, as “the rise of trade union and communist influence in the ruling party may also shift public resources towards pro-poor (instead of pro-business) projects” (p.94). In fact, the past two years have seen precisely the opposite happen. Discouragingly, this is also the section that offers the least in terms of alternatives. It seems as though disentangling South Africa’s current development path from its increasingly interlocked relationship with the minerals-energy complex, at a tremendous ecological and social cost, is not on the table at the moment.

Part Two, entitled ‘The State as the Agenda of Change: Conflicts over Implementation,’ suggests an explicit discussion of State orientation and capacity. In fact, it barely touched on the issue, looking instead primarily at civil society dynamics. In three chapters, it looked at different ways citizens have acted, to access land and services. The angle this section took on citizenship had the result of relegating the role of the State to a peripheral position in the book, lurking in the corners, and making appearances in many chapters as variously violent and oppressive (Chapter 8), anti-developmental (Chapter 4), paranoid and incompetent (Chapter 5), and completely in the hands of global capital. While all these things may be true in some situations to some extent, there is certainly a more nuanced view of the state’s role in development that is missing from the volume. Without becoming cheerleaders of the State or the ruling party, one would presume that the developmental crises would lead to an opportunity for exploration about what has led the state down its current path.

The third section, ‘Struggles over Resources and the Land’, perhaps did the best of all sections in encapsulating the dilemmas that the book as a whole aims for. It looks at a range of policies that aspired to promote rural development, from the Land Reform for Agricultural Development (LRAD) to the minimum wage legislation, and uses a range of case studies to demonstrate why, for different reasons, each has been ineffective at combatting rural poverty. It hints at some of the good intentions of government gone awry, and tells stories of how different people have been affected by rural policies.

The final section is ‘Household Interventions: Gender Issues’. The inclusion of gender issues as central to South Africa’s development is welcome, and all three chapters contributed interesting perspectives. Particularly compelling was Chapter 13’s position that “the key hindrance to gender equality in South Africa is not the high cost of addressing poor women’s needs, but rather the conservative normative underpinnings of social policy” (p.345). However, this section only seemed to touch the tip of the iceberg in terms of gender issues, focusing primarily on women’s care responsibilities and access to grants – important outward expressions of South Africa’s patriarchal culture. This section perhaps more than any, would have benefitted from greater contextual information. It drops occasional bombshells, like the fact that women’s “life expectancy at birth has dropped staggeringly from 65 in 2000 to 45 in 2004” (p.328). But

not enough is done to expand on the causes and implications of this dire situation.

Throughout the volume, voices and perspectives of young people are disappointingly absent, with virtually the only mention being an offhand comment that “it is clear that the youth is characterized by extremely high levels of anti-social behavior, criminality and descent into AIDS infection”(p.14) As acknowledged in the introduction, the issue of education, perhaps one of the country’s most significant development dilemmas, is not addressed. This is a disappointing gap in what is otherwise a wide range of issues. The environmental/social nexus the book positions itself in seems in touch with rural and industrial realities, but one of the country’s most important voices – that of the urban, underemployed, undereducated young person – is entirely missing. This arguably leaves an important gap in understanding the country’s political reality. The final chapter gives a nod of about a page in this direction, which is an inadequate treatment of something so important.

Overall, this volume contributes to some of the key developmental challenges of South Africa, and particularly does justice to the links between environmental and social justice. Don’t expect a reading of this book to brighten your day with hope for the future, but hopefully a follow up may include some case studies of where citizens and the state have effectively played a developmental role.

Caitlin Blaser

African Centre for Migration and Society
University of the Witwatersrand

Raymond Suttner. *The ANC Underground in South Africa*. Auckland Park: Jacana Media (Pty) Ltd, 2008. 198pp.

In this history of the African National Congress (ANC) underground from the 1950s to the 1980s, Raymond Suttner sets himself a twofold agenda: he aims to salvage the experiences of many past activists, whose stories may otherwise not be told; and he advances a new interpretation of the history of the ANC, calling into question its conventional periodization. He argues that contrary to received wisdom the ANC continued to be an organizational force in the country throughout the 1960s and 1970s, even with most of its leaders in exile or in jail. His argument relies on oral histories,